

Mecacci L., Yasnitsky A. Editorial Changes in the Three Russian Editions of Vygotsky's "Thinking and Speech" (1934, 1956, 1982): Towards Authoritative and Ultimate English Translation of the Book // *Психологический журнал* 2011. 4. <http://www.psyanima.ru>.

Editorial Changes in the Three Russian Editions of Vygotsky's "Thinking and Speech" (1934, 1956, 1982): Towards Authoritative and Ultimate English Translation of the Book

L. Mecacci, A. Yasnitsky

Текстологический анализ трех изданий текста книги Выготского "Мышление и речь" 1934, 1956 и 1982 г. и редакционной правки, внесенной в более поздние издания. В табличном виде представлен сравнительный анализ, восстанавливающий оригинальный текст издания 1934 года.

Ключевые слова: Выготский, текстология, анализ текста, публикации, редакторская правка, цензура, фальсификации.

This tedious and time consuming study aimed at restoring the original text of Vygotsky's "Thinking and Speech" (1934) against the background of later editorial interventions of the Soviet editions of 1956 and 1982. In the table, below, we present the results of this work.

Several comments on the notation are necessary. In square brackets (e.g., []) indicate omissions from the text that took place in later after-war editions. Then, a strikethrough (e.g., ~~—————~~) denotes a later addition to the original text of 1934.

ID	Locus in / Место в 1934	Nature of Change / Тип изменения	Locus in / Место в		Restored text / Восстановленный текст
			1956	1982	
1.	Chapter 1 12	Paragraph omission	51	19	[p. 11 of 1934:] 12] < [p.

2.	14	Phrase substitution	NA	22	> — < >
3.	Chapter 2 16	Chapter subtitle omission	56	23	
4.	16-17	Paragraph omission	56	22	< - 408). ¹ [1] -

					[p. 17]
					>
5.	17	Phrase omission	57	24	< -
6.	19	Phrase omission	58	26	< >,
7.	45	Phrase omission	87	56	
8.	46-47	Footnote omission	88	57	< 47] [.

					>
9.	48	Phrase substitution	NA	59	_____ < >
10.	54	[Unidentified] typo correction	97	66	< _____ >
11.	62	Font modification; Reference modificaion	NA	75	[Quotation from V. I. Lenin (<i>Философские мемуары</i>) is rendered in capital letters; reference is changed to a newer edition]
12.	Chapter 3 67	Quotes addition	NA	80	[] - -
13.	68	Comment addition Punctuation substitution	NA	81	[Footnote 1 is indicated as editorial:] [] , : 4,6 <1;6> 1
14.	69	Footnote omission	113	83	[] < >
15.	72	Phrase omission; Initial incertion	NA	86	— -
16.	Chapter 4 (76) 79	Quotes omission	NA	92	< > < > -
17.	79	Quotes	NA	92	< > < >

		omission			< > < >
18.	79	Italics removed	NA	93	<i>непосредственно</i>
19.	80	Reference omission	NA	94	< >
20.	80	Italics changed into block capital (2 instances)	NA	92	<i>в границах научной объективности</i> <i>Но основывать</i>
21.	85	Phrase substitution	NA	99	[changed into :] <hr style="width: 20%; margin-left: 0;"/> < >
22.	90	Phrase omission	NA	105	

					< >
23.	92	References modified	136	107	[1956:] — — [1982:] — — < ,> < >)
24.	93	Phrase omission	137	108	< <i>становится мышлением в собственном смысле этого слова</i>
25.	Chapter 5 (103), 103	Phrase omission	148	119	< >.
26.	103	Phrase substitution	NA	119	1. — < >
27.	104	Phrase omission	NA	119	. - < >
28.	118	Phrase omission; Quotes omission	NA	135	< > < >

					<p>< >.</p> <p>< ></p> <p>< >.</p> <p>></p> <p>-</p> <p>< ></p> <p><:</p>
29.	133	Phrase substitution	NA	153	<p>—e—</p> <p>< ></p>
30.	134	Phrase omission	NA	153	< >
31.	134	Reference and phrase omission	NA	153	< >
32.	136-137	Quotes omission	NA	155	[Quote from Gesell, quotation signs removed:]

					< >
					- < >
33.	137	Phrase addition	NA	157	_____ 5
34.	137	Phrase substitution	NA	157	> _____ <
35.	139	Phrase omission	NA	159	— _____ <, oe >
36.	142	Phrase substitution	NA	162	_____
37.	142	Phrase omission	NA	162	< >
38.	143	Quotes omission; Initial incerted	NA	164	< > ,

					< >.
					(—).
39.	145	Phrase omission; Phrase substitution	NA	166	< > _____
40.	145	Italics addition	NA	166	< >. <i>не-есть</i> <i>функция-семасиологическая</i>
41.	147	Phrase omission; Phrase substitution	NA	168	< > — а — < >
42.	147	Phrase omission	NA	168	< >.
43.	148	Phrase omission; Phrase substitution	NA	169	_____ < > < >
44.	148	Phrase omission	NA	169	< >.
45.	150	Phrase omission; Quotes omission	NA	172	< >

					< > < >.
46.	150	Phrase omission	NA	172	< >
47.	152	Phrase substitution	NA	173	- In 1982, the words * * are changed in * * ——— < >
48.	153	Phrase omission	NA	175	< >
49.	154	Phrase omission	204	176	< >.
50.	158	Phrase substitution	NA	180	——— <, > -

51.	Chapter 6 (163) , 163	Phrase omission	213	184	[The subtitle * * is omitted] < .>
52.	164	Phrase omission; Phrase addition	NA	186	< > _____
53.	164	Phrase addition; Phrase substitution; Italics addition; Footnote inserted	215	186	_____ < > _____ < > <i>развитие научных понятий опережает развитие спонтанных*</i> < >. [] * _____ _____ _____ _____ _____ _____ _____ _____ _____ <i>Примеч. ред.</i>
54.	164	Phrase substitution; Phrase omission	214	186	-[1956, the title of the Table is changed; in 1982, the title is omitted altogether:] _____ _____ < >
55.	164	Phrase substitution	214	186	[Inside the Table, rows titles] the subdivisions * _____ _____ _____ <

					<hr/> <hr/> <hr/> <hr/> <
56.	165	Phrase omission	NA	188	< >
57.	166	Phrase addition	NA	188	<hr/>
58.	169	Phrase omission	NA	192	<, >
59.	169	Phrase modification; Phrase omission	NA	192	<hr/> < > > <hr/> < < > < > <hr/>
60.	170	Phrase omission	NA	193	

					< >
61.	177	Phrase modification; Quotes omission	NA	201	<p>_____</p> <p>< ></p> <p>> _____</p> <p>< ></p> <p>_____ < ></p> <p>> < ></p> <p>< ></p>
62.	178	Phrase substitution	NA	202	<p>_____</p> <p>-</p>
63.	181	Phrase addition	NA	206	<p>_____.</p> <p>-</p>
64.	182	Phrase substitution	NA	206	<p>_____ < ></p>
65.	184	Phrase omission	237	209	<p>< ></p>
66.	185	Phrase omission	NA	210	<p>< ></p>

67.	195	Phrase substitution	NA	222	<p style="text-align: center;">————— < ></p>
68.	196	Italics insertion	NA	222	<p style="text-align: right;"><i>он</i> является опосредствованным через другое понятие и, следовательно, включает в себя одновременно с отношением к предмету также и отношение к другому понятию <</p> <p style="text-align: right;">></p>
69.	196	Phrase modification; Phrase omission	NA	223	<p style="text-align: center;">————— < ></p> <p style="text-align: center;">< ></p>
70.	197	Phrase modification	NA	224	<p style="text-align: center;">< > < > ———</p> <p style="text-align: center;">> <</p>
71.	197	Phrase omission; Italics addition	NA	224	

94.	219	Phrase omission; Initial insertion	NA	249	— >
95.	221	Phrase omission	276	250	< >
96.	221	Phrase substitution; Quotes addition	277	251	< >.
97.	221	Phrase substitution	NA	251	_____ < >
98.	222	Phrase omission	278	252	> <
99.	222	Phrase substitution	NA	252	_____ < >
100.	225	Phrase substitution	281	255	_____ < > _____ < >
101.	225	Phrase addition; Phrase substitution	282	256	[Fig. 2 legend revised:] _____ _____ _____ _____ _____ _____ > _____

					-
102.	225	Phrase substitution	282	255	[1982:] _____ [1956:] _____ _____ < >
103.	226	Phrase substitution	282	256	_____ < >
104.	226	Phrase substitution	283	257	[In various places, the word < > is changed in _____ four times.]
105.	227	Phrase substitution	283	257	<[1982:] _____ > _____ < > _____ < >
106.	227	Phrase substitution	284	258	[In various places, the word < > and its derivatives is changed in _____ eight times.]
107.	227	Phrase substitution	285	258-259	[In various places, the word < > and its derivatives is changed in _____ six times.]
108.	229	Phrase omission	NA	260	< >
109.	232	Phrase substitution; Italics addition	NA	263	- In 1982,; the words * * are changed in *_____* twice; part of the period is put in italics. 1934 - _____ < > _____ < > <i>еила научных понятий скрывается в той сфере, которая целиком определяется высшими свойствами понятий осознанностью и произвольностью</i> <
110.	233	Phrase substitution	NA	263	_____ < >

111.	236	Phrase substitution	NA	268	< > _____
112.	246	Phrase addition	304	279	_____ < >
113.	246	Phrase substitution	NA	279	_____ < >
114.	247	Phrase substitution	NA	280	> _____ <
115.	251	Phrase omission	NA	285	< > < >
116.	252	Phrase substitution	311	286	< > _____
117.	254	Phrase omission	NA	288	< >
118.	254	Phrase omission	NA	288	< >
119.	254	Phrase substitution	NA	288	_____ < >

120.	254	Phrase substitution	NA	288	_____ < >
121.	255	Phrase addition	NA	290	_____
122.	255	Phrase omission	NA	290	< >
123.	256	Phrase addition	NA	291	_____
124.	256	Phrase omission	NA	291	< >
125.	Chapter 7 260, 268, 276, 292, 296, 311	Numbered subsections addition	320, 329, 338, 355, 359, 376	295, 304, 314, 331, 336, 353	[In chapter 7, six subsections indicated by numbers, nonexistent in edition of 1934, introduced in the edition of 1956 and preserved in 1982 edition. Subsection 6 was introduced in edition of 1956 before In edition of 1982 this subsection is not specifically indicated.]
126.	260	Phrase addition; Footnote addition	NA	295	[:] , , _____ [Footnote:] [] _____ _____ <i>Примеч. ред.</i>
127.	262	Phrase substitution	NA	297	-

128.	265	Phrase omission	326	301	< . <[1982:] _____ 1982:] >	_____ > <[1956, >
<dh3Yp8H& tBq ghk@D&@h4€'WAS\$Ebdh						

					l>, <p>[Footnote:] [] <1 . 70 ></p>
143.	284	Phrase omission	NA	321	< >
144.	290	Phrase substitution	352	329	— < > [Note: this word was indicated as a typo on the list of typographical errors () of the first edition of 1934, and was suggested to be corrected into]
145.	295	Phrase omission	NA	335	> <
146.	305	Phrase omission	NA	346-347	< > —< > —< > < >
147.	306	Phrase substitution	NA	347	< > —————
148.	310	Phrase substitution	NA	352	[sic] ————— < > ————— < >

149.	310	Phrase substitution	NA	352	_____ < >
150.	316, 318	Subsection asterism sign elimination	381, 383	358, 361	[In the original edition of 1934, in chapter 7, there were two subsections indicated by asterism sign (triple asterix put into triangle: **) before < > & M , , respectively. In editions of 1956 and 1982, the first of these signs was omitted, while the second was preserved.]
151.	316	Phrase omission	NA	358	< > < >
152.	317	Phrase substitution	NA	360	_____
153.	318	Quotes omission; Phrase omission	NA	361	[Quotes removed in a number of places. The original quotation is from Marx and preserved as a manuscript and was first published in Moscow in 1932 as Die deutsche Ideologie. Hrsg. v. D. Rjazanow und W. Adoratskij, Marx-Engels-Gesamtausgabe (MEGA), Band I/5, Berlin 1932. Vygotsky seem to have used the original source and related it in his own translation, but without having referred to the source.] , < >, < >

154.	Bibliography 319-320		385-386	502	<p>[In edition of 1934: 41 items on the list</p> <p>In edition of 1956: 40 items, i.e. the list is preserved virtually unchanged except omitted paedological work . . . , <i>Педология подростка</i>, . . . , 1931. Note: quite a few of other publications preserved including the works by Russian and Western authors (in French, German, English, and foreign authors in Russian translation), on topics such diverse as language and thinking, comparative and animal psychology, anthropology, child and medical psychology, and, notably, paedology (e.g. . . . , 1932).</p> <p>In edition of 1982 publication was not referred to either. However, all but one 38.</p> <p>(see, above, p. 207 of 1934 edition) bibliographic items were preserved, yet not in the order of their appearance in the text, like in editions of 1934 and 1956, but non-numbered and ordered alphabetically, by the followed by foreign language publications.</p>
155.	321-323				<p>[works (. . .) is not included. The list was divided in two larger sections: 1) books, with the subsections: (a) psychology, (b) paedology; 2) articles, with the subsections: (a) psychology, (b) psychopathology and defectology, (c) popular-scientific and bibliographical works, (d) pedology. The list concludes with logically divided by not in foreign languages.]</p>

Сведения об авторах

E-mail: luciano.mecacci@yahoo.it

E-mail: anton.yasnitsky@gmail.com